

Title	Some thoughts on humor and music in Aristophanes' plays
Author(s)	DI VIRGILIO, Loredana
Citation	Mediterranean world = 地中海論集, 24: 31–60
Issue Date	2019
Туре	Journal Article
Text Version	publisher
URL	http://hdl.handle.net/10086/30844
Right	

Some thoughts on humor and music in Aristophanes' plays*

Loredana DI VIRGILIO

Introduction

Whoever deals with ancient Greek dramatic texts should never neglect that what we face today as "text" was actually a "360° performance" for the "collective experience" of the theatre, in which several means of expressions were used to captivate the audience's emotional involvement.

In particular, it is possible to approach ancient Greek comedy focusing on some elements that are illustrative of the important role performed by music, intended as both a comic work instrument and an expressive modality. It should be worth bearing in mind that music and laughter, as natural forms of expression belonging to all human beings, go beyond time and space, and some of their modes of operation could be considered "universal" indeed.

Greek comedy provides a large variety of techniques conceived for making people laugh: the so-called *onomasti komōidein* ("mocking someone directly, by name"), parody, obscenities, puns, funny accidents, masks, gestures, and so on, many of which can be used in different ways,¹ not least from a musical point of view. In fact, just as the text, gesture, costumes – and alongside them – also music could be variously used by the poet (or better, "composer") in order to express humor. Even if nowadays we lack the melodies, the study of the metrical structures of the songs can provide us a good amount of information about the comic scene. Furthermore, by observing the different uses of musical instruments into comedy, some particular figures of speech, special characters, and so on, it is possible to become aware of the important role played by music in ancient Greek comedy. Aristophanes' comedies represent an excellent opportunity for an investigation of this kind; in this sense, this paper contains, as food for thought, a brief

^{*} This paper represents a revised and extended edition of the one entitled *Laughing with Ancient Greeks. Examples of Comic Use of Metres and Sounds in Aristophanes*, presented at the Workshop *The Mediterannean as a Plaza* – co-organized by the Mediterranean Studies Group (Tokyo) and the University of Urbino "Carlo Bo" and that took place Urbino, 22-23 March 2018 – and published in Hiroshi Kato, Liana Lomiento (eds.), *The Mediterranean as a Plaza. Japanese and Italian Insights on the Great Sea*, EPHESO, vol. 6, Cisalpino Istituto Editoriale Universitario, 2018, pp. 27-47.

¹ Cfr. for example Sommerstein 1996b; Sommerstein 2009; Zimmermann 2014, pp. 149-156.

selection of passages from Aristophanes' *Birds*, *Thesmophoriazusae*, and *Frogs*, in which it is possible to identify different models of "musical strategies" used by the playwright for making his audience laugh.

It seems useful to keep in mind that the comic text can be approached with special regard to music thanks to some "universal" techniques – all analyzable – that are common to literature and music. A remarkable and easily understandable support can be found in the very interesting lesson entitled *Humor in Music*, held by the famous chief-orchestra Leonard Bernstein in 1959 within the series of *Young People's Concerts*.² In that lesson, Bernstein made clear that *music can be funny* – it is something we all know – but it has to be so for some *specific reasons*. He explained, then, several techniques of humoristic music, just as we could analyze a literary text and say why it is funny by identifying, for example, its specific figures of speech.³

The aim of these following pages is to analyze the text and the scene of Aristophanes, remembering also the teachings of Bernstein, in the attempt to present the musical techniques of comedy in a simple but -I hope - captivating way, trying to image how ancient Greeks had fun from music in theatre.

Before starting the review of the Aristophanic passages to be analyzed, it is worth warning the reader that the Greek texts of the *solo* songs (*Av.* 227-262; *Th.* 776-784 and 1015-1055; *Ra.* 1284-1295 and 1264-1277;) are going to be presented in the colometry edited by me after an in-depth study on Aristophanes' manuscript tradition;⁴ also critical apparatus and colometric apparatus are edited by me.⁵ Greek text of the other passages, instead, reproduce Wilson's edition. For *Ra.* 1284-1295, 1264-1277 and *Th.* 1015-1055 an apparatus of the sources is also provided,

² The transcript of the lesson can be found at https://leonardbernstein.com/lectures/television-scripts/ young-peoples-concerts/humor-in-music. Other bibliography on this subject can be easily found, for example GILBERT 1926.

³ Bernstein made use of masterpieces by great composers from different times, such as Gershwin, Haydn, Prokofiev, Mahler, Strauss, Mozart, Dukas, and many more. It seems meaningful that almost all of the types of humoristic music selected and presented by Bernstein to his young audience exist also in other kinds of art, including literature: surprise, incongruity, imitation, satire, pun, parody, caricature, burlesque, *etc.*

⁴ Manuscripts consulted are listed below. II *P.Oxy*.LXXIII 4935 (*Th.* 1043-1051), *saec.* II; **R** *Ravennas* 429, *saec.* X *med.*; **V** *Venetus Marcianus gr.* 474, *saec.* XI *vel* XII; **M4** *Ambrosianus* C 222 *inf.*, *saec.* XII *ex.*; **A** *Parisinus Regius gr.* 2712, *c.* 1300; Γ *Laurentianus Plut.* XXXI 15, *saec.* XIV; **M** *Ambrosianus* L 39 *sup.*, *saec.* XIV *in.*; **P20** *Parisinus suppl. gr.* 463, *saec.* XIV *in.*; **Vs1** *Vaticanus Reg. gr.* 147, *saec.* XIV *in.*; **P8** *Parisinus gr.* 2821, *saec.* XIV; U *Vaticanus Urbinas gr.* 141, *saec.* XIV; **Vv17** *Vaticanus gr.* 2181, *saec.* XIV *ex.*; **E** *Estensis gr.* 127 (a.U.5.10), *saec.* XIV *ex. vel* XV; **L** *Holkhamensis gr.* 88 *saec.* XV *in.*; **M9** *Ambrosianus* L 41 *sup.*, *saec.* XV; **M2** *Monacensis* 492, *saec.* XV; **Vp2** *Vaticanus Palatinus gr.* 67, *saec.* XV; **H** *Hauniensis* 1980, *saec.* XV; **B** *Parisinus Regius gr.* 2715, *saec.* XV; **C** *Parisinus Regius gr.* 2717, *saec.* XVI; **Ald** *editio princeps Aldina,* 1498; **Suid.** Suida, *saec.* X. Also note: **codd.**=*consensus codicum*; *p*=*consensus codicum* Vp2HC; *t*=*consensus codicum* Vv17LB; *q*=*consensus codicum* Vp2HCLVv17B. For further metrical analyses (yet not based on ancient colometries) and discussions, see ZIMMERMANN 1985 and PARKER 1997.

⁵ More technical analyses and extensive comments on the songs are contained in my doctoral thesis entitled *Le monodie di Aristofane. Metro musica drammaturgia*, discussed in March 2019 at the University of Urbino "Carlo Bo".

in order to let the reader easily individuate the tragic quotations (from different Aeschylus' dramas for *Frogs*; from Euripides' Andromeda for *Thesmophoriazusae*) contained in the songs. All English translations are taken from Alan Sommerstein's single editions of the plays.

I. Incongruity

In his *Humor in Music*, Bernstein highlighted that one of the most important features of humor is to be found in the "incongruity", the lack of sense of two or more things taken together. Incongruity produces laughter and, for this reason, has to be considered a comedy technique, even from a musical point of view. Aristophanes' plays provide a very large amount of examples in which a "contrast" is realized through the discrepancy between the singing characters and the metre used, or between the metre and the scene in general.

It is very interesting to look at this elementary – but indeed functioning technique – as used in *Thesmophoriazusae*, a comedy based on the parody of Euripidean tragedies. In particular, the successful use of this strategy appears clear in the first of the In-law's monodies of the play (*Th.* 776-784).

- 776 ὦ χεῖρες ἐμαί,
- 777 ἐγχειρεῖν χρῆν ἔργῷ πορίμῷ.
- 778 ³ ἄγε δή, πινάκων ξεστῶν δέλτοι,
- 779 δέξασθε σμίλης όλκούς,
- 780 κήρυκας ἐμῶν μόχθων. οἴμοι,
- 781 ⁶ τουτὶ τὸ ῥῶ μοχθηρόν.
- 782 χώρει, χώρει. ποίαν αὔλακα·
- 783 βάσκετ', ἐπείγετε πάσας καθ' ὁδούς,
- 784 ⁹ κείνα, ταύτα[•] ταχέως χρή.

[R]

777 χρῆν Bentley : χρὴ R, Suid. π 2064 **783** καθ' ὁδούς Biset : καθόδους R **784** κείνα Mu2 ταύτα. Grynaeus (*hac* Divus) : ταῦτα R

776		an
777		2an
778	3 00-00	2an
779		2an,
780		2an
781	6	2an,
782	00	2an

 783
 -00-00-00 2an

 784
 9
 -00-00 ||

 2an,
 2an,

Oh my hands,
you should be setting to work at a task that demands resourcefulness.
Come now, you smooth tablet-sheets, receive the chisel-cut tracks
780 that will proclaim my troubles (dammit, this letter *rho* is giving trouble!)
[*To the knife*] Go on, go on. What a furrow!
[*As he throws the tables as far as he can in all directions*]
Hie you, hasten by every road, this way, that way; you must be quick!

Euripides' In-law has been captured by the women because he had just entered, disguised as a woman, the exclusive female assembly during the Thesmophoria in order to defend the tragedian from the charge of misogyny. The poor prisoner thinks out a way to escape, recalling an episode from Euripidean *Palamedes*, where Oeax wrote a message to his father on his oar-blades, and then he entrusted them to the waves of the sea. The similarity between the two scenes – the tragic original and the comic one – is explained by the In-law himself in the lines that precede the monody (*Th.* 765-775).

- 765 ἄγε δή, τίς ἔσται μηχανὴ σωτηρίας; τίς πεῖρα, τίς ἐπίνοι'; ὁ μὲν γὰρ αἴτιος κἅμ'εἰσκυλίσας εἰς τοιαυτὶ πράγματα οὐ φαίνετ', οὕπω. φέρε, τίν'οὖν <ἂν> ἅγγελον πέμψαιμ' ἐπ'αὐτόν; οἶδ'ἐγὼ καὶ δὴ πόρον
- 770 ἐκ τοῦ Παλαμήδους· ὡς ἐκεῖνος, τὰς πλάτας ῥίψω γράφων. ἀλλ'οὐ πάρεισιν αἰ πλάται. πόθεν οὖν γένοιντ'ἄν μοι πλάται; πόθεν <πλάται;> τί δ'ἄν, εἰ ταδὶ τἀγάλματ'ἀντὶ τῶν πλατῶν γράφων διαρρίπτοιμι; βέλτιον πολύ.
- 775 ξύλον γέ τοι καὶ ταῦτα, κἀκεῖν'ἦν ξύλον.

INLAW [*to himself*]: Come now, what device will be able to save me? what experiment, what idea? Because the man who's responsible for this, the man who pitched me into all this trouble, hasn't put in an appearance – [*looking hopefully off to the side to see if*

Euripides is approaching] no, he still hasn't. Now then, what messenger could I send to fetch him? Ah yes, I know a trick from his *Palamedes*. I'll do what that man did, write on those oar-blades and throw them in the sea. Only the oar-blades aren't here. Now where could I get oar-blades from? where, oh where? Hey, what if I was to write on these votive tablets instead of the oar-blades, and throw them around in all directions? That's much better. After all, these are wood, and the other were wood too. [*He takes some votive tablets from under the altar, and begins to carve messages on them with the sacrificial knife*.]

The whole scene is established on paratragedy and based on many contrasts: everything here – the metre too – is "perfectly incongruous", and for this reason "perfectly comic".

As highlighted by the Italian scholar Enrico Medda, in this monologue is already possible to recognize an "Aristophanic reinterpretation of tragic monologue",⁶ in particular of the type that regards a decision to be hold. While this kind of monologue in tragedy takes generally place *ad spectatores*, here Aristophanes makes the In-law plan his escape while many women do surround him.⁷ Furthermore, the comic character is dressed as a woman and now is prisoner in the sanctuary Thesmophoreion, trying to act as a tragic hero but actually speaking to wooden tablets, and having some problems in writing the letters of his savior's name "Euripides", as we learn from 1. 781.

From a musical point of view, the "contrast" is to be found in the rhythm used for the Inlaw's song. In line with the tragic scene the character is re-interpreting, the monody is composed in the so-called "lamentation anapaests", whose many examples are in tragedy.⁸ In this scene, a simple man dressed as a woman and in the act of trying to catch Euripides' attention, throwing on the ground wooden tablets stolen from the sanctuary, uses a rhythm of tragic lamentation: in other words, *the rhythm is the basic tragic element, while the context is comic*. Anapaests with long syllables in tragedy are generally associated with grief and sorrow, but here the slow rhythm emphasizes instead the carving, and expresses the difficulty of the operation. Particular effort is comically expressed when the In-law has to carve the round line of the Greek letter *rho* (P) of the name EYPIIII Δ E Σ – the metre underlines Mnesilochus' strain, since $\dot{\rho}$ makes long the previous syllable. All this composition is "incongruous", and if we analyze the text paying specific attention to metrics, it is possible to understand how music was in contrast with text, scene and character, perhaps imagining people laughing while hearing this song.

⁶ MEDDA 2006, p. 100 («rilettura aristofanea del monologo tragico»).

⁷ Cfr. Medda 2006, p. 101.

⁸ Cfr. Gentili – Lomiento 2008, pp. 129-130.

II. Imitation

"Imitation" can be considered the opposite technique of contrast. As Bernstein declares in his lesson, «the first and simplest way that music can be amusing is by simply imitating nature. It's one of the oldest ways of making you laugh – by imitating things or people». As just in the previous example of *Thesmophoriazusae* part of comedy was created by the fact that the In-law was imitating Oeax – and we must not forget that another actor is playing the part of Euripides and then, on a second level, of Euripides acting as several tragedian heroes – also music can imitate something in a comic way. We are dealing with a sort of "universal law": if we come back again to Bernstein's words, the similarity between modern and ancient times, together with modern and ancient basic principles of music, appears really striking: «it's like comedians who do impersonations of famous stars: like impersonating Greta Garbo... or impersonating Katherine Hepburn... But the way music does this is by imitating sounds, sounds we all know, like mosquitos, or trains, or ox-carts, or little chickens, or a big sneeze».

2.1. Vocal imitation of sounds. From a literary point of view, imitation of sounds is known under the name of "onomatopoeia", a very common figure of speech so strictly related with music – technically, and not by chance, it is a figure of sound. As regards sounds of nature, the renowned Hoopoe's second song in Aristophanes' *Birds* (Av. 227-262) – a comedy where the concept of *mimēsis* is used by the dramatist in every sense and single possibility – represents the most enlightening example we can consider.

227	ἐπο ποι πόι πο πο πο ποι πο ποί.
228	ιώ ιώ ιτώ ιτώ ιτώ ιτώ
229	³ ἴτω τις ὦδε τῶν ἐμῶν ὁμοπτέρων
230	ὄσοι τ' εὐσπόρους ἀγροίκων γύας
231	νέμεσθε, φῦλα μυρία κριθοτράγων
232	6 σπερμολόγων τε γένη,
233 ^a	ταχὺ πετόμενα,
233 ^b	μαλθακὴν ἱέντα γῆρυν.
234	⁹ ὅσα τ'ἐν ἄλοκι θαμὰ βῶλον ἀμφι-
235	τιττυβίζεθ' ὦδε λεπτὸν
236	ήδομένα φωνᾶ.
237	12 tio tio tio tio tio tio tio tio.
238	ὄσα θ' ὑμῶν κατὰ κήπους
239	ἐπὶ κισσοῦ κλάδεσι νομὸν ἔχει,
240 ^a	15 τά τε κατ' ὅρεα τά τε
240 ^b	κοτινοτράγα τά τε κομαροφάγα,

SOME THOUGHTS ON HUMOR AND MUSIC IN ARISTOPHANES' PLAYS 37

241		ἀνύσατε πετόμενα
242	18	πρὸς ἐμὰν αὐδάν·
243		τριοτό· τριοτό· τοτοβρίξ.
244		οἵ θ' ἑλείας παρ' αὐλῶνας ὀξυστόμους
245	21	ἐμπίδας κάπτεθ', ὅσα τ' εὐδρόσους
246		γῆς τόπους ἔχετε λει-
247		μῶνά τ' ἐρόεντα Μαραθῶνος,
248	24	ὄρνις πτεροποίκιλος
249		άτταγᾶς ἀτταγᾶς.
250		ὦν τ' ἐπὶ πόντιον οἶδμα θαλάσσης
251	27	φῦλα μετ' ἀλκυόνεσσι ποτᾶται,
252		δεῦρ' ἴτε πευσόμενοι τὰ νεώτερα,
253		πάντα γὰρ ἐνθάδε φῦλ' ἁθροΐζομεν
254	30	οἰωνῶν ταναοδείρων.
255		ἥκει γάρ τις δριμὺς πρέσβυς
256		καινὸς γνώμην
257	33	καινῶν ἔργων τ' ἐγχειρητής.
258		ἀλλ' ἴτ' ἐς λόγους ἅπαντα
259		δεῦρο δεῦρο δεῦρο δεῦρο
260	36	τοροτοροτοροτίξ
261		κικκαβαῦ κικκαβαῦ
262		τοροτοροτορολιλιλίξ.

[RVAMUFM9Vp2HCVv17LBAld]

232-233^a coniung. AUVp2HVv17LAld 233^a-233^b coniung. M **233^b-234** θαμὰ | U 234 **234-235** βῶλον – λ επτὸν | U ἀμφιτιττυβίζεθ' ὦδε | qAld $\beta \tilde{\omega} \lambda ov | q Ald$ 235-236 coniung. A $\lambda \epsilon \pi \tau \delta v - \varphi \omega v \tilde{\alpha} \mid q \text{Ald}$ **238-239** κλάδεσι | Α έπὶ κισ- | *q*Ald **239-240**^a νομόν – τε (alterum) | A $-\sigma o v - \sigma \rho ε \alpha | q Ald$ **240^a-240^b** κοτινοτράγα | M τε (tertium) | U τά (alterum) – κομαροφάγα 240^a spatium atque punctum inter $\delta\rho\epsilon\alpha$ et t α ponit M9 240^b spatium atque punctum | qAld in alto inter κοτινοτράγα et τά ponit M9 τε | RV Γ M9 τά – κομαροφάγα | M 240^b-241 spatium inter κομαροφάγα et ἀνύσατε ponit M9 κομαροφάγα – πετομένα RVUΓM9 241-242 coniung. AM*p*LBAld **243-244** βρίξ – όξυστόμους | U **244** ὅσα – αὐλῶνας | qAld 244-245 έμπίδας Α τὰς ὀξυστόμους ἐμπίδας | qAld **245** κάπτεθ' – εὐδρόσους τε |q Ald 245-246 κάπτεθ' – ἔχετε **246-247** λειμῶνα – Μαραθῶνος | A Μαραθῶνος | U γ ῆς (vel γ ῆς) – καὶ λειμῶ- | q Ald 247 A -να – Μαραθῶνος | qAld 248-249 coniung. AUF 255-257 coniung. A 256-257 coniung. 256 om. A U

227 έπο ποι πόι πο πο πο ποι πο ποί R : ἐπό· ποί· πό· πό· πό· πο· πο· ποί V ἐπόποί· πόπό· πόπό· πόπό ποποί Α ἐποποί· πό· πό· πό· πό· πό· πό· πό· ποί Μ ἐποποῖ· ποποποποποποι ποποῖ U ἐπὸ ποῖ (ἐπό ποί Γ²) · πό· πό· πό· ποῦ (ποῦ $(Γ^1)$ ποποῦ (πόποῦ $(Γ^2)$) $Γ^1$ ἐ πο πο πο πο πο πο πο πο Μθ ἐποποὶποποποὶ· ποπὸι· ποποι: Vp2 ἐποποι: ποποιό: ποποι: Vv17 εποποι: ποποιό: ποποιό: ποποιό: LAld ἐποποῖ. πό. πό. ποποί. ποποί Β ἐποποί ποποποί ποποι ΗC, ἐποποί ποποί ποποί ποποί Suid. ε 2807 228 itù (vel iτώ) quater RVAMM9pVv17LAld : quinquies Suid. ε 2807, semel Σ^{v} , iτώ quater Γ, iτω quater U^{ac}B, bis Σ^{R} , ĩtw ĩtw itừ itừ U^{pc} **230** ἀγρῶν q (ἀγροίκων s.l. B) 229 ità A έμῶν om. A γύας $M\Gamma^{pc}$: γυίας RVAU $\Gamma^{ac}M9qAld$ 234-235 αμφιτιττυβίζεσθ' (-τιτζυ- U) AU 237 to octies RVMUΓM9Vp2CtAld, Suid. ε 2807 : septies H decies AM9^{ac} 239 κλάδεσσι R κλάδεσι
ν $\Gamma^{\rm pc}$ 242 αὐδάν RAΓ^{ac}UMpVv17LAld v.l. Σ^{M} : ἀοιδάν VMΓ^{pc}M9B² **243** τριοτό[·] τριοτό[·] τοτοβρίξ R, Suid. ε 2807 : τριοττό· τριοττό· τοβρίξ V τριοτό τροτιό τότοβριξ (-βρύξ B^{ac}) AB^{ac} τριοτό· τροτιοτό· τοβρίξ ΜΓ¹ τροττό· τροτιοττό· τοβρίξ (-βρύξ B^{pc}) Γ^{pc}M9B^{pc} τριοτυτροτιστοτριβρίξ U τριοτό· τριοτό· τροτιοτό (τοτρι- Vp2C 244 οἵ RVAMUΓM9B^{pc} : ὅσα $q(B^{ac})$ Ald εὐλείας Α ἑλείους Γ^{pc} 245 τὰς τρι- Η) τοβρίξ pVv17LAld έμπίδας CLBAld ὅσαι R κάμπτεθ' pVv17L, Suid. ε 1020 (κάμπτετε) post εὐδρόσους add. τε pVv17L **246** post ἕχετε add. καὶ qAld **247** τὸν ἐρόεντα qAld 248 τε post ὄρνις add. qAld **251** ποτᾶτε 256 καινός γνώμην om. A RacAld **254** post οἰωνῶν add. τῶν Vp2Vv17Ald **257** ἕργων τ' RVUΓM9Vv17LAld : τ' ἔργων ABp ἕργων M, Suid. κ 1175 259 δεῦρο quater AUVp2CVv17L : ter H quinquies RVMΓM9B, Suid. τ 2807 **260** торо- quater (тороторотор- Vv17) RUFHVv17, Suid. τ 2807 : quinquies MVp2CLBAld sexies VM9 septies A $-\tau i\xi$ RVM9 : $-\tau i\xi$ AMU Γq , Suid. τ 2807 **261** κικκαβαῦ bis RVΓM9qAld, Suid. τ 2807 : κικκαβᾶν bis M κικκαβᾶν κικκιβαβᾶ A κικκαζαῦ κικκαβαῦ U **262** τορο- ter V^{pc}U Γ *q*Ald : quater RA bis Suid. τ 2807, τοτοτοτορο M τριοτο M9 v.l. Γ -λιλιλίξ RAL : τολιλιλίξ VMpVv17LAld τολιλίγξ UFB, Suid. τ 2807 τολιλιλιλίξ M9 v.l. Γ

227	extra metrum	
228		3ia
229	3	3ia
230	00-0-0-	ba ia cr
231	0-0-00-00-	ia ^{penth} 3da ^{^ ^} (iambel)
232	6	3da
233ª	000000	tr <i>vel</i> ia
233 ^ь	-0-0-0-0	2tr
234	9 0000000-0-0	2ia hypercat
235	-0-0-0-0	2tr
236		3da
237	¹² extra metrum	
238		2ion ^{mi}
239		ion ^{mi} tr hypercat
		<i>vel</i> ion ^{mi} ia hypercat (2ion ^{mi} hypercat)

240ª	15	0000000	an
240 ^b		H	$2an_{\wedge\wedge}$
241			an
242	18		an
243		extra metrum	
244			4cr
245	21	-0000-0-	3cr
246		-0-000-	2cr
247			3cr, vel 2cr sp
248	24		tel
249		-00-	2cr
250		-00-00-00	4da (alcm)
251	27	-00-00-00	4da (alcm)
252		-00-00-00-00	4da (alcm)
253		-00-00-00-00	4da (alcm)
254	30		2an,
255			2an
256			an
257	33		2an
258		-0-0-0-0	2tr
259		-0-0-0-0	2tr
260	36	extra metrum	
261			2cr
262		extra metrum	
230	 Epopoi, popopopopoi, popoi! Io, io, ito, ito, hither, hither, hither let all my feathered fellows come! 230 All who dwell in the country plough-lands rich in seed, the myriad tribes of barleycorn-eaters and the races of seed-gatherers 		

that fly swiftly and utter soft notes, and all who in the furrows often
235 gently twitter over the turned soil with joyful voices, like this, tio tio tio tio tio tio tio!
And all of you who find their food in gardens on the ivy branches,

240	and you of the hills, the oleaster-eaters and the arbutus-eaters,
	hurry, come flying to my call:
	trioto trioto totobrix!
	And you who in the marshy valleys swallow
245	the sharp-biting gnats, and all you who inhabit
	the well-watered regions of the land and the lovely meads of Marathon,
	and the bird of patterned plumage, francolin, francolin!
250	And you whose tribes fly with the halcyons
	over the swell of the open sea,
	come hither to learn the news;
	for we are assembling here all the tribes
	of long-necked fowls.
255	For a sharp-witted old man has come here,
	novel in his ideas
	and an attempter of novel deeds.
	Come to the meeting, all of you,
	hither, hither, hither!
270	Torotorotorotix!
	Kikkabau, kikkabau!
	Torotorotorolililix!

This song arises from the mouth of the Hoopoe, king of the birds, to call and gather every kind of bird, as the Hoopoe is going to explain a new political project. At the beginning of the comedy, in fact, Peisetaerus and Euelpides, two Athenians disappointed by their city, have reached the Hoopoe, asking for advice on some new towns in which eventually live free from any annoyance (*Av.* 39-48).

	οἱ μὲν γὰρ οὖν τέττιγες ἕνα μῆν' ἢ δύο
	οι μεν γαρ συν τεττιγες ενα μην η συσ
40	ἐπὶ τῶν κραδῶν ἄδουσ', Ἀθηναῖοι δ' ἀεὶ
	ἐπὶ τῶν δικῶν ἄδουσι πάντα τὸν βίον.
	διὰ ταῦτα τόνδε τὸν βάδον βαδίζομεν,
	κανοῦν δ' ἔχοντε καὶ χύτραν καὶ μυρρίνας
	πλανώμεθα ζητοῦντε τόπον ἀπράγμονα,
45	ὅποι καθιδρυθέντε διαγενοίμεθ' ἄν.
	ό δὲ στόλος νῷν ἐστι παρὰ τὸν Τηρέα,
	τὸν ἔποπα, παρ'ἐκείνου πυθέσθαι δεομένω,
	εἴ που τοιαύτην εἶδε πόλιν ἦ 'πέπτατο.

That's the thing: the cicadas chirp on the branches for a month or two, the Athenians chirp away at lawsuits continually all their lives long. That's why we're trekking this trek; with a basket, a pot and some myrtle-wreaths, we're wandering in search of a trouble-free place where we can settle and pass our lives. Our journey now is to see Tereus the hoopoe, wanting to find out from him if he's seen a city of that kind anywhere he's flown over.

After evaluating the possibilities shown by the Hoopoe, Peisetaerus gets to an eccentric idea: he wants the Hoopoe himself to establish a new city, the city of birds, located in the air, where they could finally live in peace. The Hoopoe is excited: he is ready to found the new city, but first he has to summon the community of the birds in order to have a complete approval. Thus, he calls his companions by singing this long monody, which is really a masterpiece of music.

We shall later come back on the extraordinary metrical-rhythmical mimesis, but for the moment, it will be sufficient to list the onomatopoeias created by Aristophanes to reproduce birds' different voices:

- 227 ἐπο ποι πόι πο πο πο ποι πο ποί;
- 1. 228 ió ió iτώ iτώ iτώ iτώ;
- 1. 237 τιο τιο τιο τιο τιο τιο τιο;
- 243 τριοτό· τριοτό· τοτοβρίξ;
- 1. 249 ἀτταγᾶς ἀτταγᾶς (francolin's Greek name is onomatopoeic);

 259 δεῦρο δεῦρο δεῦρο δεῦρο (the adverb "here" is used as a sort of onomatopoeia, with a repetition leading to the real onomatopoeias of ll. 260-262);

1. 260 τοροτοροτοροτοροτίξ;

- 1. 261 κικκαβαῦ κικκαβαῦ (as for the francolin, owl's Greek name is onomatopoeic too);
- 1. 262 τοροτοροτοροτορολιλιλίξ.

Apart from sounds of nature, voice can also imitate sounds produced by objects, with comic effects.

In *Frogs*, for example, Euripides blames Aeschylus for the monotony of his compositions. After having sung a first monody, composed of Aeschylean tragedy quotations whose every second line presents the same rhythm (*Ra.* 1264-1277, see forward), Euripides' aim is to demonstrate that Aeschylus' songs, as long as one tries to vary the way of composing, yet are sounding always the same. It is for this reason that Euripides introduces a second monody, this time composed "in the manner of *kitharodic nomoi*" (ll. 1278-1282):

- Δι. ὦ Ζεῦ βασιλεῦ, τὸ χρῆμα τῶν κόπων ὅσον.ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν εἰς τὸ βαλανεῖον βούλομαι·
- 1280 ὑπὸ τῶν κόπων γὰρ τὰ νεφρὰ βουβωνιῶ.
 ΕΥ. μὴ πρίν γ' ἀκούσῃς χἀτέραν στάσιν μελῶν ἐκ τῶν κιθαρωδικῶν νόμων εἰργασμένην.

DIONYSUS: Lord Zeus, what an orgy of striking! [*Making as if to depart*] As far as I'm concerned, I want to go to the bath-house; all these strokes have given me swellings in the ... kidneys.

EURIPIDES: Not before you've heard another series of songs, made out of lyre tunes.

Arranged as a little *nomos*, the following monody is a combination of several Aeschylean lyric quotations, again with a recurrent anapaestic line (on metrical-rhythmical comedy see forward), but also with a recurrent onomatopoeic line created to imitate the sound of a *kithara*. In fact, in order to reproduce a typical Aeschylus' song, Euripides would really need a *kithara*, but he does not have it. Therefore, after every two lines, he reproduces by himself, by using his own voice, the sound of the *kithara*, by singing *tophlattothrattophlattothrat*.⁹

1284 1285 1286	 ὅπως Ἀχαιῶν δίθρονον κράτος Ἑλλάδος ἥβας ³ τοφλαττοθραττοφλαττοθρατ
1287 ^a	Σφίγγα δυσαμεριᾶν
1287 ^b	πρύτανιν κύνα πέμπει
1288	⁶ τοφλαττοθραττοφλαττοθρατ
1289 ^a	σύν δορὶ καὶ χερὶ πράκ-
1289 ^b	τορι θούριος ὄρνις
1290	⁹ τοφλαττοθραττοφλαττοθρατ
1291	κυρεῖν παρασχὼν
1292	ἰταμαῖς κυσὶν ἀεροφοίτοις
1293	¹² τοφλαττοθραττοφλαττοθρατ
1294	τὸ συγκλινές τ' ἐπ' Αἴαντι

9 In his edition, Sommerstein accepts Fritzsche's emendation of the text. For other vocal imitations of strings consider, for example, Ar. *Pl.* 290 θρεττανελο θρεττανελο, or Archil. fr. 324 West, whose onomatopoeia τήνελλα has been interpretated, since the antiquity, as imitation of the sound of *kithara* (cfr. *Schol. vet.* Pi. *O.* 9. 1c, vol. I p. 266 Drachmann: Ἀρχίλοχος τῷ Ἡρακλεῖ ὕμνον ... ἀπορήσας κιθαρῷδοῦ διά τινος λέξεως τὸ μέλος ἐμιμήσατο). Cfr. ROCCONI 2003, pp. 81, 91.

Some thoughts on humor and music in aristophanes' plays 43

1295 τοφλαττοθραττοφλαττοθρατ

1284-1285 A. Ag. 108-109
 1287^a-**1287**^b TrGF A. Sphinx F 236
 1289^a-**1289**^b A. Ag. 111-112

 1291-1292 TrGF A. inc.fab. F 282
 12924 TrGF A. Thressai F 84

[RVM4AUEP20P8Vs1LAld]

 1284-1285 coniung. UP20P8
 1287^a-1287^b coniung. AUVs1
 1289^a-1289^b πράκτορι | VM4ELAld

 coniung. RAUP20P8Vs1
 1289^b θούριος ὄρνις | VM4ELVs1Ald
 1291-1292 coniung. AUVs1

 1292 ἰταμαῖς κυσὶν | ἀεροφοίταις | P8
 1293 om. U

 1285 ήβαν LAld
 1286, 1288, 1290, 1293, 1285 τὸ φλαττο- vel sim. codd., φλαττο- Fritzsche, cfr.

 v. 1296
 1287ª δυσαμεριᾶν Dindorf : -ίαν codd.
 1291 κουρεῖν V
 1292 ἀεροφοίταις AP8

 -φύτοις V
 1294 τ' om. LAld
 hunc v. in quibusdam exemplaribus defuisse testatur Timachidas ap. Σ

1284	<u> </u>	iapenth
1285		$2an_{\wedge}$
1286	3 0-0-0-0-	2ia
1287ª	-00-00-	3da 🔨
1287 ^b	00-00	anpenth
1288	6	2ia
1289ª	-00-00-	3da 🔨
1289 ^b	00-00	anpenth
1290	9 0-0-0-0-	2ia
1291	0-0	iapenth
1292		$2an_{\wedge}$
1293	12	2ia
1294	0-0-00-0	2ia,
1295	0-0-0-0-	2ia

1284/5 How two Achaean kings united in power, of Hellas' young manhood (phlattothrattophlattothrat) Sphinx, the bitch that presided o'er days of ill-fortune, were sped with (phlattothrattophlattothrat) spear and avenging hand by a bird of martial omen

1290	(phlattothrattophlattothrat)
	which handed them over to be the brutal air-roaming hounds' prey
	(phlattothrattophlattothrat)
	and those who gathered around Ajax
1295	(phlattothrattophlattothrat)

It seems not an improbable suggestion that Euripides, every time in the act of singing the onomatopoeia, pretends to play the imaginary musical instrument, comically moving his arms on an invisible *kithara*.

2.2. *Rhythm imitating content.* As it has been said at the beginning of paragraph 2, imitation may act in many different ways, even from the musical point of view. Looking again Hoopoe's second monody in *Birds*, we are provided of one of the most striking examples of the mimetic use of metres-rhythms. As already highlighted by the Italian scholar Roberto Pretagostini, both the first and the second songs of Hoopoe in this comedy are established on the concept of metrical mimesis.¹⁰ At II. 209-222, in fact, the Hoopoe sings a high-refined song to his wife the Nightingale: this monody is composed in "lamentation anapaests", as the Nightingale's human past (*i.e.* when she was Prokne) is marked by the murder of her own son Itys and by dramatic events involving his husband Tereus (then become the Hoopoe). At the same time, the second Hoopoe's monody, the call of the community of the birds category by category, is characterized by the evocation of each kind of birds by a constantly new specific metrical choice. It is possible to summarize the seven big "sections" created by the strong relationship between the text and the metrical structure, while we shall focus in detail only on two particularly interesting passages, two prime examples of metrical mimesis.

I) ll. 227-229 (c. 1-3): calling all the birds – iambs;

II) ll. 230-237 (*c*. 4-12): birds dwelling in the country plough-lands – iambs, trochees, dactyls; III) ll. 238-243 (*c*. 13-19): birds from gardens – ionics *a minore*; birds from the hills – anapaests; IV) ll. 244-249 (*c*. 20-25): birds dwelling in places full of humidity – cretics; the single francolin is distinguished by a telesillean, but the section is recomposed in cretics with the last line/*colon*, which contains the name of the francolin;

V) ll. 250-254 (c. 26-30): birds from the sea – dactyls;

VI) ll. 255-257 (c. 31-33): Peisetaerus – anapaests;

VII) ll. 258-262 (c. 34-38): conclusion - trochees, cretics and extra metrum.

Here I would like to take into special consideration ll. 240-243, referring to the small birds picking olives with their beaks, invited to hurry up and come to the Hoopoe. Except for the

10 Cfr. Pretagostini 1988.

extra metrum of 1. 243, this section is composed entirely of anapaests. The exclusive use of short syllables is to imitate the smallness and the speedy of those birds, in what could be imagined as a musical *accelerando* or *vivace*. This sense of vivacity is realized by the combination of this particular metrical form and the high number of alliterations: so, imitation of birds is realized by metre and voice, and the exaggeration of the speedy is cause of comedy too – the global effect is similar to that of a tong-twister. Using again Bernstein's words, «speed has been one of the main things about wit always; "fast and funny" – that's the rule for jokes».

240 ^a	15	τά τε κατ' ὄρεα τά τε	
240 ^b		κοτινοτράγα τά τε κομαροφάγα,	
241		ἀνύσατε πετόμενα	
242	18	πρὸς ἐμὰν αὐδάν·	
243		τριοτό τριοτό τοτοβρίξ.	
240 ^a	15	0000000	an
240 ^b		H H	2an
241			an
242	18	00	an
243		extra metrum	

The contrary happens, with an effective comic result, al ll. 255-257, when the Hoopoe has to explain the meaning of the call: an old man has come with a new political project, which involves the birds. Anapaests again characterize this section, but now with a very different form if compared with those of the previous example. Here the anapaests present only long syllables, because the intent now is to evocate the slow dragging-on typical of old people like Peisetaerus. The musical effect is that of a *rallentando*, in comic contrast with the general lively variety of the rest of the monody dedicated to birds.

255		ἥκει γάρ τις δριμὺς πρέσβυς	
256		καινὸς γνώμην	
257	33	καινῶν ἔργων τ' ἐγχειρητής.	
255			2an
256			an
257	33		2an

The power of rhythms to produce a special effect on the audience and to induce some particular perception on people is testified also by Aristides Quintilianus, *de Mus.* II 15, 15-17

"Winnington-Ingram":

Τῶν δ' ἐν ἴσῷ λόγῷ οἱ μὲν διὰ βραχειῶν γινόμενοι μόνων τὰχιστοι καὶ θερμότεροι, <οἱ δὲ διὰ μακρῶν μόνων βραδύτεροι> καὶ κατεσταλμένοι ...

Of the rhythms in equal ratio, those composed only of short syllables are most swift and more passionate [*thermoteroi*, lit. "hotter"], those composed only of long syllables are slower and calm. (transl. Barker).

III. Parody of music, musicians and musical instruments

For making people laugh, music can also be used – and so it was by ancient comedy playwrights – as a parody of itself, and even thanks to the comic and parodic use of a musician. Well-known are, for example, the personification of the Music in Pherecrates' *Chiron*, or the use of (more or less) technical musical terms with reference to sexuality, like χ_{i} α_{ξ} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} α_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} α_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} α_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} α_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} ω_{i} σ_{i} ω_{i} $\omega_$

At the beginning of the comedy, the Hoopoe goes behind the $sk\bar{e}n\bar{e}$ and sings a sweet serenade whose text, full of musical references, is an invitation for his wife the Nightingale to wake up and raise her wonderful song with her voice (*Av.* 209-222). Only at the end of this actor's *solo*, the audience hears the voice of the Nightingale, reproduced by the sound of the *aulos*, as it is testified in medieval manuscripts by the *parepigraphē* $\alpha\dot{\nu}\lambda\epsilon\tilde{i}$ (or $\alpha\dot{\nu}\lambda\epsilon\tilde{i}$ $\tau_{L\zeta}$) collocated after 1. 222, and also by the ancient *scholium* 222c Holwerda.¹² Everything happens behind the *skēnē*, which reproduces the wood, as several stage directions identifiable from the text itself inform us.¹³ The Nightingale herself will not appear before 1. 667, when she is finally invited to enter the stage in order to reach her companions from the Chorus. In fact, she is revealed to be not only a bird – the Nightingale indeed – but the real *auletēs*, as she is provided of a strange beak similar to a pair of skewers and of a sort of belt on her head (ll. 672 $\dot{\rho}\nu\gamma\chi_{O\zeta}$ $\dot{\sigma}\beta\epsilon\lambda(\sigma\kappaotv \check{\epsilon}\chi\epsilon_{I}; 674$ $\dot{\alpha}\pi\dot{\sigma}$ $\tau\eta\zeta$ $\kappa\epsilon\phi\alpha\lambda\eta\zeta$ $\tau\dot{o}$ $\lambda\epsilon\mu\mu\alpha$). As we were already informed that the voice of the Nightingale was the voice of the *aulos*, now in these two objects we can identify the two canes of the *aulos* and

¹¹ Apart from the classical study of TAILLARDAT 1965, with specific reference to pp. 458-459, an accurate summary is provided in RECCHIA 2017, p. 64 n. 2, in a study of Aristophanes' fr. 930 Kassel-Austin.

¹² αὐλεῖ RV: τοῦτο παρεπιγέγραπται δηλοῦν, ὅτι μιμεῖταί τις τὴν ἀηδόνα RVΓ2M ὡς ἔτι ἕνδον οὖσαν ἐν τῃ λόχμῃ VM9Γ²M.

¹³ Cfr. II. 202-203 (Hoopoe) δευρὶ γὰρ ἐμβὰς αὐτίκα μάλ' εἰς τὴν λόχμην, / ἔπειτ' ἀνεγείρας τὴν ἐμὴν ἀηδόνα; 207-208 (Peisetaerus) ἄγ' ὡς τάχιστ' εἰς τὴν λόχμην / εἴσβαινε κἀνέγειρε τὴν ἀηδόνα; 223-224 (Euelpides) ὦ Ζεῦ βασιλεῦ, τοῦ φθέγματος τοὐρνιθίου· / οἰον κατεμελίτωσε τὴν λόχμην öλην. 265-266 (Peisetaerus) ἄλλως ἄρ' οὕποψ, ὡς ἔοικ', εἰς τὴν λόχμην / ἐμβὰς ἐπῷζε χαραδριὸν μιμούμενος

the *phorbeia*, respectively.¹⁴ As a result, we can conclude that the *auletes* of the play is used as a *real character* of the play, surprising the audience. We can also add that, as Euclpides is seized with sexual passion towards the Nightingale, Aristophanes' spectators would have laughed at this amazing whole scene. The Nightingale-*auletes* reaches then the Chorus for the *parabasis* (II. 676-800), as it is confirmed by the text of the *kommation* (II. 676-684):

	ὦ φίλη, ὦ ξουθή,				
	ὦ φίλτατον ὀρνέων,				
	πάντων ξύννομε τῶν ἐμῶν				
	ὕμνων, ξύντροφ' ἀηδοῖ,				
680	ἦλθες, ἦλθες, ὥφθης,				
	ήδὺν φθόγγον ἐμοὶ φέρουσ'·				
	ἀλλ', ὦ καλλιβόαν κρέκουσ'				
	αὐλὸν φθέγμασιν ἠρινοῖς,				
	ἄρχου τῶν ἀναπαίστων.				
	O beloved one, O vibrant-throated one,				
	O dearest of birds,				
	partner of all my songs,				
	Nightingale my companion,				
680	you have come, you have come, you have appeared,				
	bringing your sweet voice to me!				
	Now, you who play the notes of springtime				
	on the fair-sounding pipe,				
	introduce our anapaests.				

But just few lines after the *parabasis*, around l. 848 a religious procession enters the stage, in order to sustain the Priest in the foundation of the new city. The Chorus, as we said, has its own *auletes*, the Nightingale, but for this special circumstance invites Chaeris, a real *auletes*, to accompany its song for the religious moment. It seems that Chaeris, in fact, was a musician being used to take part in city rites playing his *aulos*, and more than once he is mocked by Aristophanes or by other comedians for his bad playing of for his habit to take advantage of circumstances. In Ar. *Ach.* 16, in fact, Dikaiopolis narrates how he once got upset when Charis appeared in theatre for playing the *Orthios*; at l. 866 of the same comedy, then, some annoying pipe-players are depicted as "offspring of Chaeris" (Xαιριδῆς βομβαύλιοι). In Ar. *Pax* 951, while Trygaios and his Servant are preparing the sacrifice, the Chorus exhorts to be quicker, because if Chaeris sees them, "he'll come up uninvited to play the pipes" and then "he'll puff

14 Cfr. Romer 1983; Barker 2004.

and labour" for getting something.¹⁵ Schol. (vet.Tr.) Av. 858a Holwerda reports that Charis became *auletes* after having been a "cold" *kitharōidos* (ὁ Χαῖρις οὐτος κιθαρφδὸς ψυχρὸς καὶ γέγονεν αὐλητής) and, in this sense, in Pherecr. fr. 6 Kassel-Austin, from Agrioi, Chaeris is expected to be mentioned in a list of the worst *kitharōidoi*.¹⁶

From the text of *Av*. 848-861 it is possible to understand that Charis appears on the scene, he plays something on his *aulos*, and then he is sent away badly. His playing, in fact, is immediately stopped by Peisetaerus, who reproaches him as "raven" (l. 861), notoriously the most unmusical of the birds.

PEISETAERUS:

[...] As for myself, I'll summon the priest to organize the procession, so that I can sacrifice to the new gods. [...] CHORUS:

I agree, I concur,

I hereby join in recommending

that great and solemn processional hymns should rise

to the gods, and at the same time as well, to win

their favour, we should sacrifice a sheep or so.

Let it rise, rise, rise, the Pythian cry,

and let Chaeris pipe an accompaniment to our song.

[*The piper plays on, solo, but untunefully.* ...]

PEISETAERUS [calling angrily to the piper]:

You, stop your blowing! [*Coming closer to him*] Heracles, what's this? By Zeus, I've seen plenty of strange things, but this I've never seen, a raven in a piper's muzzle!

People, then, does not laugh just because an actor-character is moved away from the scene, but because they hear something terrible, possibly out-of-tune. It is a pure comic moment, inserted by Aristophanes just when concentration and solemnity are expected: an accident in the fluidity of the plot, realized by using music and musicians, and even playing with their identities at the same time. Parody and surprising are working together for comic intention.

Strictly related with the comic use and abuse of music and musicians is also the parody of musical instruments, as it happens in *Frogs*. During the scene of the poetic agon between Aeschylus and Euripides, the older poet introduces the first Aeschylus' parodic song (ll. 1309-

¹⁵ Pax 950-955 οὕκουν ἀμιλλήσεσθον; ὡς / ὁ Χαῖρις ὑμᾶς ἴδῃ, / πρόσεισιν αὐλήσων ἄκλη- / τος, κἆτα τοῦό' εὖ οἶδ' ὅτι / φυσῶντι καὶ πονουμένῷ / προσδώσετε δήπου.

^{16 (}A.) φέρ' ἴδω, κιθαρωιδὸς τί κάκιστος ἐγένετο; / (B.) <ò> Πεισίου Μέλης. μετὰ <τὸν> Μέλητα <δ'> ἦν / (A.) ἔχ' ἀτρέμ', ἐγὦιδα, Χαῖρις.

1328) against Euripides with these words (ll. 1304-1308):

ἐνεγκάτω τις τὸ λύριον. καίτοι τί δεĩ
 1305 λύρας ἐπὶ τοῦτο; ποῦ 'στιν ἡ τοῖς ὀστράκοις
 αὕτη κροτοῦσα; δεῦρο, Μοῦσ' Εὐριπίδου,
 πρὸς ἥνπερ ἐπιτήδεια ταῦτ' ἄδειν μέλη.

ΔΙ. αὕτη ποθ' ή Μοῦσ' οὐκ ἐλεσβίαζεν, οὕ.

AESCHYLUS: Bring me my lyre, someone – but on second thoughts, who needs a lyre for this job? Where's that girl who plays percussion with broken bits of pot? [*Calling within*] Come here, Muse of Euripides; you're the proper accompaniment for these songs to be sung to.

[The "Muse of Euripides" comes out; she is an old and ugly woman, heavily made up, and dressed like a prostitute. She holds a pair of potsherds, which she will clash together to provide an accompaniment to the ensuing songs].

DIONYSUS: This Muse used to be – well, she certainly wasn't part of the Lesbian tradition!

A sequence of rapid *coupes-de théâtre* characterizes this scene. In order to start singing, at 1. 1304 Aeschylus requires a lyre, but immediately he corrects himself: they lyre is a too noble instrument to perform Euripides' poetry... some clappers will be sufficient! A comic joke is realized by the substitution of the musical instrument, but we are also dealing with a parody of a second level. In fact, these same clappers are not invoked with their proper name, $\kappa \rho \delta \tau \alpha \lambda \alpha$, but with $\delta \sigma \tau \rho \alpha \kappa \alpha$, earthenware. Furthermore, a freakish Muse is invited on the scene: she is not a proper Muse, but a prostitute dancing in a lascivious way while playing the earthenware. This example is indicative of the wide scope of parody, involving also music in it. The whole Aristophanic scene, in fact, contains continuous parodic references to the Euripidean *Hypsipyle*, thanks to a continuous interaction of literal quotations or echoes within the monody,¹⁷ allusion to some scenes,¹⁸ the call of the Muse that in tragedy pushed the queen Hypsipyle, by now slave to Nemea, to play the rattles to accompany Opheltes' sleep,¹⁹ *etc*.

IV. Parody of a style

Parody of a poetical style, with reference to some precise verses, can be often connected

¹⁷ Cfr. l. 1312 δροσιζόμεναι and fr. 7, 4 Cockle = *TrGF* E. *Hypsipyle* F 753c, 4; l. 1329 and fr. 57+81, pp. 110-111 Cockle = *TrGF* F 765; l. 1322 and p. 137 Cockle, *TrGF* F 765.

¹⁸ Line 1322 could refer to Hypsipyle embracing one of his sons; cfr. SOMMERSTEIN 1996a, p. 276.

¹⁹ Cfr. fr. 1, II, 7-14 Cockle = *TrGF* E. *Hypsipyle* F 742f, 7-14.

with musical parody. Aristophanes in *Ra.* 1264-1277 provides a very enlightening example: Euripides' first monody is meant to imitate Aeschylus poetry, in order to make clear to Dionysus that Aeschylus is always repeating himself, producing boring lyric. At ll. 1249-1250, and then 1261-1262, Euripides introduces his parodic song with these words:

Εγ. καὶ μὴν ἔχω γ' οἶς αὐτὸν ἀποδείξω κακὸν μελοποιὸν ὄντα καὶ ποιοῦντα ταὕτ' ἀεί.

> ... πάνυ γε μέλη θαυμαστά[.] δείξει δὴ τάχα. εἰς ἒν γὰρ αὐτοῦ πάντα τὰ μέλη ζυντεμῶ.

EURIPIDES: All right then, I've got material with which I shall prove that he's a bad lyric writer and that what he composed was always the same thing.

[*sarcastically*] Oh, *very* marvelous *indeed*! We shall see presently. I'm going to cut down all his lyrics to a single measure.

The monody Euripides is going to perform is made of fragments from different Aeschylus' tragedies, and it is characterized by the repetition of a *refrain* consisting in the line $i\eta \kappa \delta \pi ov ov \pi \epsilon \lambda \delta \theta \epsilon \iota \varsigma \epsilon \pi' \dot{\alpha} \rho \omega \gamma \delta v$, extrapolated from Aeschylus' *Myrmidons* (fr. 132 Radt). Actually, if we consider the ancient colometry of the song, the sense of repetition is even rhythmic, thanks to the recurrence of a $2an_{\wedge}$ (or *paroemiac*), always with the same aspect, in given positions of the whole piece. In fact, being the monody a cento of Aeschylus' verses, for each quotation every first line is always metrically different, while the second one is always a $2an_{\wedge}$. Euripides' intent is to show, from a musical point of view, that as long as Aeschylus tries to change metres and rhythms – and even trying to pass from one play to another – he always falls back into the same one. The comic "hypnotic" effect of this musical choice is such "hammering"²⁰ and "effective" that even Dionysus, performing his duties as judge of the poetic competition, is dragged along by this repetitive anapaestic rhythm and, when he interrupts Euripides by commenting on the song, he unconsciously uses the same anapaests.

1264 ^a	Φθιῶτ' Ἀχιλλεῦ,
1264 ^b	τί ποτ' ἀνδροδάϊκτον ἀκούων
1265	³ ἰὴ κόπον οὐ πελάθεις ἐπ' ἀρωγάν;
1266 ^a	Έρμᾶν μὲν πρόγονον

20 Cfr. also Dionysus' ll. 1278-1280 ("Lord Zeus, what an orgy of striking!" etc.)

Some thoughts on humor and music in aristophanes' plays 51

1266 ^b 1267		τίομεν γένος οἱ περὶ λίμναν. 6 ἰὴ κόπον οὐ πελάθεις ἐπ' ἀρωγάν;
1268	Δ i.	δύο σοι κόπω, Αἰσχύλε, τούτω.
1269		κύδιστ' Άχαιῶν Άτρέως
1270	Ey.	⁹ πολυκοίρανε μάνθανέ μου παῖ.
1271		ἰὴ κόπον οὐ πελάθεις ἐπ' ἀρωγάν;
1272	Δ i.	τρίτος, ϣσχύλε, σοι κόπος οὖτος.
1273	Ey.	¹² εὐφαμεῖτε· μελισσονόμοι
1274		δόμον Ἀρτέμιδος πέλας οἴγειν.
1275		ἰὴ κόπον οὐ πελάθεις ἐπ' ἀρωγάν;
1276ª		¹⁵ κύριός είμι θροεῖν
1276 ^b		ὅδιον κράτος αἴσιον ἀνδρῶν.
1277		ἰὴ κόπον οὐ πελάθεις ἐπ' ἀρωγάν;

1264 ^a -1264 ^b TrGF A.	Myrmidones F 132	1265, 1267, 1271, 1275, 1277 TrGF A.	Myrmidones F 132
1266 ^a -1266 ^b <i>TrGF</i> A.	Psychagogoi F 273	1269-1270 TrGF A. Telephus F *238	1273-1274 TrGF
A. Hiereai F 87	1276^a-1276 ^b A. Ag. 104		

[RVM4AUEP20P8Vs1LAld]

1264 ^a -1	1264 ^b coniung. VAM4UEP20)P8Vs1LAld	spatio inter Acille et τ	tí relicto coniung. R
1266°-1	1266 ^b coniung. AUP8Vs1	1266ª-1267 om. E	1269 Άτρέως τε L	1269-1270 coniung.
U	1276 ^a -1276 ^b coniung. AUVs	l κράτος L	1276 ^ь αἴσιον ἀνδρῶν L	

post 1263 parepigrapham διαύλιον (vel -ειον) προσαυλεῖ τις praebent plerique codd., Suid. δ 804, διαύλιονπροσαυλεῖ Ald, om. AΆχιλλεῦ RVAUEVs1, Σ^{ME} : Άχιλεῦ M4P20P8LAld, Σ^{V} 1265 ἰὴ κόπον Heath(cfr. Σ) : ἰἡκοπον codd.1266^a-1267 om. E1268 δύω UP8Vs11269 Ἀτρέως τε L1270μου om. A1272 ὦ Αἰσχύλε L Αἰσχύλε Ald1273 εὐφημεῖτε VE1276^b ὅδιον P20L, cfr. A.Ag. 104: ὅς δῖον R ὅσιον VM4AUEP8Vs1Ald

1264 ^a		iapenth
1264 ^b	00-00-00	2an,
1265 ³	0- 00-00-00	<i>□− extra metrum</i> 2an _^
1266 ^a	00_	3da
1266 ^b	00-00-00	2an,

1267	6 0- 00-00-00	\sim - <i>extra metrum</i> 2an _^
1268	00-00-00	2an,
1269		ia cho
1270	⁹ ∪	2an,
1271	0- 00-00-00	\sim - <i>extra metrum</i> 2an _^
1272	<u>-</u>	$2an_{\wedge}$
1273	12	4da
1274	00-00-00	2an,
1275	0- 00-00-00	\sim - <i>extra metrum</i> 2an _^
1276 ^a	15	3da
1276 ^b		2an,
1277	u- uu-uu-uu	<i>∽− extra metrum</i> 2an _∧

EURIPIDES [to pipe accompaniment]:

Phthian Achilles, O why, when thou hearest the sound of men dying -

1265 Ai, ai – stricken, advancest thou not to their succour?
 We, the folk of the lake-shore, do honour to Hermes our forebear – Ai, ai – stricken, advancest thou not to their succour?

DIONYSUS [*setting two pebbles aside*]: That's two strikes against you, Aeschylus. EURIPIDES:

1270 O most glorious of the Achaeans, great ruler and son of Atreus, mark what I tell thee – Ai, ai – stricken, advancest thou not to their succour?

DIONYSUS [*setting aside a third pebble*]: Aeschylus, that's your third strike. EURIPIDES:

Keep ye silence: the Bee-wards approach, to open Artemis' temple -

1275 Ai, ai – stricken, advancest thou not to their succour?
 Strong am I yet to declare that sign that sped men on their journey – Ai, ai – stricken, advancest thou not to their succour?

V. Aprosdoketon

Finally, we are going to consider a particular form of surprise, the so-called *aprosdoketon*, which could be defined as the «disappointment of the spectators' expectation».²¹ *Asprosdoketa*

²¹ ZIMMERMANN 2014, p. 155.

may regard many aspects of the text and the stagecraft, for example puns, *paragrammastismoi*, jokes or the appearance of an unforeseen character or a character acting or dressing in an unexpected way. Musical *aprosdoketa* are nowadays traceable from metrics, so that we are able to have an idea of what surprising effects could happen from a rhythmic point of view, always connected with the semantic aspects of the text itself.

The conclusion of this paper follows a sort of *Ringkomposition*, because among Aristophanes' songs, a very appropriate example can be found in the second monody of the In-law, in *Th*. 1015-1055. The context of this song is the same of the first one analyzed in these pages, as the In-law is still prisoner of the women, since every attempt to escape reveals itself to be unsuccessful. The man is still complaining to himself because he is enchained. If at ll. 777-784 he compared himself to Oeax, this time he considers his fate to be very similar to that of Andromeda, Euripidean character from the namesake tragedy represented just the year before. He decides, then, to sing a complaint made of quotations of Andromeda's original tragic complaint. The parody is complete, and involves *opsis*, *lēxis* and *mousikē*.

Within the monody are condensed many lexical *aprosdoketa*, like the continuous switching from the use of the feminine (In-law acting as Andromeda) to the masculine (In-law speaking as himself), as at ll. 1020-1021 and 1022-1023; the *paragrammatimos* $\kappa \eta \mu \delta v$ for $\kappa \tilde{\omega} \mu o v$ at l. 1031, with reference to the unwholesome passion of Athenians for voting; at l. 1033 the substitution of the marine monster supposed to devour Andromeda with Glaucetes, a well-known glutton in Athens, often mocked by comedy playwrights.²² Lexical aprosdoketa are realized with - or better, strengthened by – metrical *aprosdoketa*. Since the song is composed of tragic quotations, it shows text and metrics belonging to the relative tragedy. But the In-law is not able to carry on with his fiction from the very beginning until the end, and each time, after few lines of quotation, he speaks as himself, as a man, interrupting the (para)tragic performance and obtaining a hilarious effect. Every time the register of the In-law swifts from tragic to comic, from high to low, also the metre changes, generally – and significantly – with a rhythmic upturning (note the use of the *epiplokē* for stressing the passages from tragic to comic register, for example at ll. 1055-1051 with the upturning of the dactyls into anapaests; also the passage from a quotation to a proper comic line or section is often marked by the change of metre). It is possible to acknowledge to metre (and music) a guiding function for the understanding of the scene and the song: with these rhythmic surprising "seesaws" fitting the text, comic passages are amplified, and the audience has more fun.

Both dramaturgical and musical parody count on the fame of the model: Andromeda's tragic complain must have been very popular for the audience that had listened to it just the year

²² Cfr. schol. ad Th. 1033 Regtuit ἐπεὶ ὀψοφάγος καὶ γαστρίμαργος ὁ Γλαυκέτης, ὡς ἐν Εἰρήνῃ δηλοῦται; Ar. Pax 1008 Μορύχῷ Τελέα Γλαυκέτῃ κτλ.; Pl.Com. fr. 114 K.-A. ὡ θεῖε Μόρυχε πῶς γὰρ οὐ δαίμων ἔφυς; / καὶ Γλαυκέτῃς ἡ ψῆττα, καὶ Λεωγόρας, / οῦ ζῆτε τερπνῶς οὐδὲν ἐνθουμούμενοι. Parody is enhanced by the sounding wordplay between κήτει and Γλαυκέτῃ.

before.²³ Aristophanes uses that lyric complaint two times in *Thesmophoriazusae*: in the monody, we are telling about and in the one just following in the play, at ll. 1065-1072. Unfortunately, we are not able to recover the melody of the songs, but it seems probable that the *solo* of ll. 1015-1055 had recalled the music of the Euripidean model. Translating Fraenkel's words, we have to admit that "the Athenian audience must have had more fun than us, because often it was able to distinguish parodies from original already from the melodies".²⁴

Here is the text of *Th*. 1015-1055, provided with its English translation and metrical analysis: indicated in bold type, it is possible to identify the specific passages in which metrical *aprosdoketa* accompany verbal *aprosdoketa*.

1015		φίλαι παρθένοι φίλαι,
1016		πῶς ἂν ἀπέλθοιμι καὶ
1017	3	τὸν Σκύθην λάθοιμι;
1018		κλύεις, ὦ
1019		προσάδουσ' ἀϋταῖς ἐν ἄντροις;
1020	6	κατάνευσον, ἕασον ὡς
1021		τὴν γυναῖκά μ' ἐλθεῖν.
1022		άνοικτος ὄς μ' ἕδησε τὸν
1023	9	πολυπονώτατον βροτῶν.
1024		μόλις δὲ γραῖαν ἀποφυγὼν
1025		σαπρὰν ἀπωλόμην ὅμως.
1026	12	őδε γὰρ ὁ Σκύθης φύλαξ
1027		πάλαι ἐφέστηκ' ὀλοὸν ἄφιλον
1028		ἐκρέμασέ <με> κόραξι δεῖπνον.
1029	15	όρᾶς; οὐ χοροῖσιν οὐδ'
1030		ύφ' ήλίκων νεανίδων
1031		[ψῆφον] κημὸν ἕστηκ' ἔχουσ'
1032	18	ἀλλ' ἐν πυκνοῖς δεσμοῖσιν ἐμπεπλεγμένη
1033		κήτει βορὰ Γλαυκέτη πρόκειμαι.
1034		γαμηλίφ μὲν οὐ ξὺν
1035	21	παιῶνι, δεσμίφ δέ,
1036		γοᾶσθε μ', ὦ γυναῖκες, ὡς
1037		μέλεα μὲν πέπονθα μέλεος,
1038	24	ὣ τάλας ἐγώ τάλας,
1039		ἀπὸ δὲ συγγόνων ἄλλ'

²³ Arist. *Pr.* XIX 40 contains an interesting consideration about the "natural" phenomenon of "going after" a well-known melody, as it produces in the "captured" listener a feeling of pleasure.

²⁴ Cfr. Fraenkel 1962, p. 178.

Some thoughts on humor and music in aristophanes' plays $\ 55$

1040		ἄνομα πάθεα, φῶτα λιτομένα
1041	27	πολυδάκρυτον Αΐδα γόον φλέγουσα,
1042		αίαῖ αίαῖ ἒ ἕ,
1043		ὃς ἔμ' ἀπεξύρησε πρῶτον,
1044	30	ὃς ἐμὲ κροκόεντ' ἀμφέδυσεν,
1045		ἐπὶ δὲ τοῖσδε τόδ' ἀνέπεμψεν
1046		ίερόν ἕνθα γυναῖκες.
1047	33	ἰώ μοι μοίρας ἂν ἔτικτε δαίμων ,
1048		ὣ κατάρατος ἐγώ. τίς ἑμὸν οὐκ ἐπόψεται
1049		πάθος ἀμέγαρτον ἐπὶ κακῶν παρουσία;
1050	36	εἴθε με πυρφόρος αἰθέρος ἀστὴρ
1051		τὸν βάρβαρον ἐξολέσειεν.
1052		οὐ γὰρ ἔτ' ἀθανάταν φλόγα λεύσσειν
1053	39	ἐστὶν ἐμοὶ φίλον, ὡς ἐκρεμάσθην,
1054		λαιμότμητ' ἄχη δαιμόνι', αἰόλαν
1055		νέκυσιν ἐπὶ πορείαν.

 1015-1016
 TrGF E. Andromeda F 117
 1018-1020
 TrGF E. Andromeda F 118
 1022-1023
 TrGF E.

 Andromeda F 119
 1029-1032
 TrGF E. Andromeda F 122
 1034-1041
 TrGF E. Andromeda F 122

[RΠ]

1027 όλοὸν | R 1027-1028 ἄφιλον – κόραξι | R 1028-1029 δεῖπνον – χοροῖσιν | R 1029-1030 οὐδ' – νεανίδων | R

1017 λάθοιμι Ellebodius : λάβοιμι RMu2 1019 προσάδουσ' ἀυταῖς Sommerstein : προσαδοῦσσαι R^2 (ex -ουσσαι, quod habet Σ) Mu2 **1028** με suppl. Mehler **1031** ψῆφον del. Hermann 1032 έμπεπλεγμένη Mu2 : ένπεπλεγμένη R 1034-1035 ξύν παιῶνι Zanetti (cum carmine Divus) : ξυμπαιῶνι **1039**: ἄλλ' Scaliger : ἀλλὰν RMu2, ἄνομ' Blaydes RMu2 **1040** λιτομένα Enger (cf. Σ^{R} δεομένη) : λιτομέναν RMu2, ἀντομένα et -μέναν $\Sigma^{\rm Rv.l.}$ 1041 φλέγουσα Enger : φεύγουσαν RMu2 1044 άμφέδυσεν Σ^R : ἐνέδυσεν RMu2 1047 ἃν ἔτικτε Casaubon : ἄνετικτε RMu2 1052 λεύσσειν Biset : λεύσειν RMu2 **1054** δαιμόνι' Bachmann ap. Fritzsche : δαιμόνων RMu2

1015	00-0-	ba ia
1016		cho cr
1017	³ ⊻ ∥	2tr
1018	J——	ba
1019	000	3ba
1020	6 00-00-0-	glyc

1021		-0-0	2tr
1022		0-0-0-0-	2ia
1023	9		2tr _^
1024		0-0-0000-	2ia
1025		0-0-0-0-	2ia
1026	12	000-0-0-	2tr, <i>vel</i> cr ia
1027		000000000	2tr
1028		< <u>.></u> .−.−⊻	2tr
1029	15	00-0-	ba ia
1030		0-0-0-0-	2ia
1031			2cr
1032	18		3ia
1033			ia 2tr
1034		0-0-0	2ia _^ (ia ba)
1035	21	∪−∪−∪−⊻	2ia _^ (ia ba)
1036		0-0-0-0-	2ia
1037			2tr
1038	24	-0-0-0-	$2 \mathrm{tr}_{\wedge}$
1039		000-0	cr ba
1040		000000−0000⊻∥	do ia
1041	27		do 2tr
1042		extra metrum	
1043		000-0-0-0	2tr
1044	30	00000-0-0	2tr
1045		000-0000-0	2tr
1046		<u>.</u>	$2 \operatorname{tr}_{\wedge \wedge} \operatorname{vel} \operatorname{pher}$
1047	33	J J-J	do $2tr_{\wedge\wedge}$
1048			do $2tr_{\wedge}$ vel hem ^m $2tr_{\wedge}$
1049		$\bigcirc \bigcirc $	3ia
1050	36		$4 da_{\wedge}$
1051			2an,
1052			$4da_{\wedge}$
1053	39	-00-00-00	$4da_{\wedge}$
1054			2do
1055			tr

1015 Maidens, beloved maidens, how can I get away and

SOME THOUGHTS ON HUMOR AND MUSIC IN ARISTOPHANES' PLAYS 57

escape unseen by that Scythian?²⁵

Dost thou hear, O thou in the caves that singest in response to my cries?

- 1020 Grant my prayer and let me
 go home to my wife!²⁶
 Pitiless he who bound me,
 me the most afflicted of men:²⁷
 having just escaped from that decayed
- 1025 old woman, I'm done for just the same.For this Scythian, long since posted to guard me, has hung me up, doomed, friendless, to make a meal for the ravens.Seest thou this? Not now in choral dances, nor
- 1030 among the young woman of my own age
 do I stand, holding a voting-urn by the funnel,²⁸
 but enmeshed in numerous bonds
 I am cast forth to be food for the monster... Glaucetes.²⁹
 Not with a hymn for a bride
- 1035 but with one for a captive lament me, you women, for I am wretched and have suffered wretchedly O unhappy, unhappy man that I am! and treatment, moreover, at kindred hands, against all right, though I besought the man,
- 1040 kindling a tearful lament of death –
 ah me, ah me! [sobbing] –
 he who began by shaving me,
 he who garbed me in a saffron robe,

²⁵ The In-law swifts from the tragic role of Andromeda to himself, referring to the Scythian guard placed next to him.

²⁶ The In-law surprises the audience by praying for the possibility for him to come back to his wife, thus abandoning the role of Andromeda.

²⁷ Even if, within the tragic quotation, the use of the masculine in place of the feminine is cause of comedy, the passage from 2ia to $2tr_{\wedge}$ is already witnessed in Andromeda's respective fragment of *P.Oxy.* 2628.

²⁸ The *scholium* to this passage simply notes that these words are taken again from *Andromeda* (πάλιν ἐξ Ἀνδρομέδας), but does not specify the "boundaries" of the quotation. Van LEEUWEN 1904, p. 30, supposes that, for Aristophanes' l. 1031, the respective Euripidean text could be κῶμον ἕστηκ' ἄγουσ', modified by Aristophanes in κημὸν ἕστηκ' ἔχουσ' in order to mock In-law's *philodikia*.

²⁹ See p. 23 and e note 22.

- 1045 and moreover sent me up to this sanctuary, where the women are. Alack for my fate which a god engendered!³⁰ Accursed that I am! Who will not behold my unenviable sufferings, in which such sorrows are present?
 1050 Would that the fiery meteor of the sky –
- might utterly destroy that barbarian! For no longer does it please me to look on the immortal flame of day, since I have been hung up here in a god-sent torment to make one slit one's throat,
- 1055 on a darkling journey to the land of the dead.

Many more examples of musical comedy strategies can be traced in Aristophanes' plays. What has been provided here is just a selection presented as food for thought and intended to show, in a hopefully sufficient and simple way, how ancient Greek comedy used all kinds of resources for making the audience laugh.

It is worth to specify that, when we speak of "Aristophanes", we actually deal with the *paradosis* of his text. Nevertheless, by making a deep investigation into the colometry of the songs, as transmitted by ancient manuscripts and papyri – as for the examples proposed in this paper – it is possible to notice a very strong relationship between colometry and dramaturgy, as between the text, its metrics and its meaning, and even with other poetic texts (as we have seen). Coherence and meaning are so strong, from both a musical and dramaturgical point of view, that appears impossible to consider the ancient colometries only a mechanical work of some late grammarian. On the contrary, in every case – as it is demonstrable through concrete examples – into the *paradosis* we seem able to recognize the poet's touch and will.

As regards the main issue of these pages, we may conclude that, on one hand, investigating in depth metrical structures, by putting them in relationship with the text and the scene, allows the modern reader of Aristophanes to enter the poet's laboratory and understand his way of composing. On the other hand, we are able to recognize that the mechanisms of humor in music are not so far from our mentality and way of composing/understanding music and its messages.

³⁰ This passage could be considered a comic *aprosdoketon* if we think that the *daimon*, for the In-law, is actually Euripides, the cause of all of his troubles.

Some thoughts on humor and music in aristophanes' plays $\ 59$

References	
Barker 1989	Greek musical writings, vol. 2 Harmonic and acoustic theory,
	edited by A. Barker, Cambridge 1989.
Barker 2004	A. Barker, Transforming the Nightingale: aspects of Athenian
	musical discourse in the Late Fifth Century, in Music and the
	Muses. The Culture of Mousikē in the Classical Athenian City,
F 10/0	edited by P. Murray and P. Wilson, New York 2004, pp. 185-204.
Fraenkel 1962 Gentili – Lomiento 2008	E. Fraenkel, <i>Beobachtungen zu Aristophanes</i> , Roma 1962.
Gentili – Lomiento 2008	B. Gentili, L. Lomiento, <i>Metrics and rhythmics. History of poetic forms in ancient Greece</i> , translated by E. Ch. Kopff, Pisa-Roma
G 10 2 (
Gilbert 1926	H.F. Gilbert, <i>Humor in Music</i> , «The Musical Classical Quarterly», 1926, Jan. 12, 1, pp. 40-55.
Medda 2006	E. Medda, Aristofane e il monologo, in Comicità e riso tra
	Aristofane e Menandro, Atti del Convegno di studi, Cagliari 29
	settembre – 1 ottobre 2005, a cura di P. Mureddu e G.F. Nieddu,
D. num 1007	conclusioni di M.G. Bonanno, Amsterdam 2006, pp. 91-112.
Parker 1997 Pretagostini 1988	L.P.E. Parker, <i>The Songs of Aristophanes</i>, Oxford 1997.R. Pretagostini, <i>Parola, metro e musica nella monodia dell'Upupa</i>
I RETAGOSTINI 1700	(Aristofane, Uccelli 227-262), in La musica in Grecia, Atti del
	Convegno Internazionale, Urbino, 18-20 ottobre 1985, a cura di B.
	Gentili e R. Pretagostini, Roma – Bari 1988, pp. 189-198.
Recchia 2017	M. Recchia, Aristoph. fr. 930 KA. e Nub. 969-971: tra Nuvole
	Prime e Nuvole Seconde?, «QUCC», n.s. 116, n. 2, 2017, pp. 63-
	78.
Rocconi 2003	E. Rocconi, Le parole delle Muse. La formazione del lessico tecnico
	musicale nella Grecia antica, Roma 2003.
Romer 1983	F.E. Romer, <i>When is a bird not a bird?</i> , «TAPhA», CXIII, 1983, pp. 135-142.
Sommerstein 1987	The Comedies of Aristophanes, vol. 6 Birds, edited with translation
	and notes by A.H. Sommerstein, Warminster 1987.
Sommerstein 1994	The Comedies of Aristophanes, vol. 8 Thesmophoriazusae, edited
	with translation and notes by A.H. Sommerstein, Warminster 1994.
Sommerstein 1996a	The Comedies of Aristophanes, vol. 9 Frogs, edited with translation
Source and a 100/h	and notes by A.H. Sommerstein, Warminster 1996.
Sommerstein 1996b	A.H. Sommerstein, <i>How to avoid being a</i> komodoumenos, «CQ», vol. 46, no. 2, 1996, pp. 327-356.
Sommerstein 2009	A.H. Sommerstein, <i>Talking about Laugher and Other Studies in</i>
Semilar Loop	The sentire sent function and other bundles in

	Greek Comedy, Oxford 2009.
Taillardat 1965	J. Taillardat, <i>Les images d'Aristophane: études de langue et de style</i> , Paris 1965.
van Leeuwen 1904	<i>Aristophanis Thesmophoriazusae</i> , cum prolegomenis et commentariis edidit J. Van Leeuwen, Lugduni Batavorum 1904.
Wilson 2007a	<i>Aristophanis fabulae</i> , recognovit brevique adnotatione critica instruxit N.G. Wilson, tomus I: <i>Acharnenses Equites Nubes Vespae</i> <i>Pax Aves</i> , Oxonii 2007.
Wilson 2007b	Aristophanis fabulae, recognovit brevique adnotatione critica instruxit N.G. Wilson, tomus II, Lysistrata Thesmophoriazusae Ranae Ecclesiazusae Plutus, Oxonii 2007.
Zimmermann 1985	B. Zimmermann, Untersuchungen zur Form und dramatischen Technik der Aristophanischen Komödien, Band II: Die anderen lyrischen Partien, Königstein/Ts. 1985.
Zimmermann 2014	B. Zimmermann, <i>Aristophanes</i> , in <i>The Oxford Handbook of Greek</i> <i>and Roman Comedy</i> , edited by M. Fontaine and A.C. Scafuro, Oxford 2014, pp. 132-159.